

## SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Downer EDI Works Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	Demonstrated recent experience in works of similar nature. All examples were in coastal or environmentally sensitive areas.	Large scale company with 50+ WA civil staff. Detailed experience of key personnel supplied & comprehensive list of equipment.	Thorough response provided which covered most aspects of works. A provisional programme was supplied.	Located in Redcliffe. All employees are from Perth area. They use local subcontractors & suppliers where possible.	85%	\$2,650,336.51	1
VDM Earthmoving Contractors Pty Ltd T/as Malavoca All requirements have been met.	Yes	Demonstrated significant experience in large scale road works with some experience in undertaking works in a beach dune environment.	In operation since 1986 with 90 staff & 100+ pieces of equipment. Brief details of staff supplied.	No specific work methodology or provisional programme supplied. Response did not reflect ability of tenderer.	Located in Welshpool. They have 5 employees who live locally & would source additional local staff where possible.	72%	\$3,789,696.61	2
Mako Civil Pty Ltd Stated no insurance of the works will be obtained. Can be requested by City, so considered further.	Partially compliant	Demonstrated experience mostly in municipal & drainage works. All examples were recent & included several local govt contracts.	In operation 18+ yrs with 70 employees. Experience, qualifications & roles of key personnel specified. An adequate list of equipment was supplied.	Provided a brief work methodology & provisional works programme. The response covered the general requirements of the project.	Located in Maddington. They will use local suppliers & subcontractors where possible.	67.6%	\$4,288,190.00	3

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
		Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects	Capacity	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
JMS Mining & Civil (Aust) Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	Most experience of subdivisional works nature. No demonstrated experience in coastal or environmentally sensitive areas.	Australia-wide company with 21 management staff plus field staff. Experience of key personnel & list of equipment provided.	A very brief generalised response provided. Demonstrated adequate understanding of project.	Located in Belmont. They use local subcontractors, employ local staff where possible and undertake community sponsorship.	66.9%	\$4,117,080.00	4
Environmental Industries Pty Ltd & Curnow (WA) Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	Environmental Industries supplied 7 example contracts. The scope had similarities to the City's project. Curnow (WA) gave extensive list of projects, but no scope or details included. Difficult to ascertain relevance to City's project.	<b>Environmental Industries</b> A landscaping/ horticulture business with 100+ staff. Experience of key personnel supplied & list of equipment. <b>Curnow (WA)</b> In operation since 2005 with 10+ staff. No experience of staff or equipment provided.	Methodology & programme supplied which covered most aspects of project. Project to be a joint venture between 2 contractors. Was not clear who would be undertaking which components of the works.	Environmental industries are located in Huntingdale, Curnow located in Joondalup.	63.2%	\$6,137,191.66	5

