

SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price Ranking	Qualitative Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in completing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Dalecoast Pty Ltd T/as Graffiti Systems Australia	Yes	In operation 16+ years with 35 FTE's. Provided responsibilities and experience of staff. Have comprehensive training program. Provided safety policy, no injuries past 5 yrs. Hold ISO 9001 accreditation.	Demonstrated considerable experience in contracts of a similar nature. Is City's current contractor and has contracts with Cities of Wanneroo, Swan & Subiaco.	Demonstrated comprehensive understanding of required tasks. Response included details of staff training, graffiti assessment procedures, administration & reporting and methodology for each form of graffiti removal.	Are located in Welshpool. They offer the use of environmentally friendly, biodegradable products at no additional cost to the City.	85.5%	Option A – 1 Option B – 1	1
All requirements have been met.								
Rolluka Nominees Pty Ltd T/as Kleenit	Yes	In operation 21+ yrs with 60+ operators. The experience & skills of key personnel was detailed with a list of equipment included. Have a well documented safety management system.	Demonstrated considerable experience in providing similar services to 6 local govts, the Dept of Housing & Works and the Public Transport Authority.	Demonstrated comprehensive understanding of City's requirements. The response included graffiti assessment processes, reporting procedures and graffiti removal methodology.	Are located in Kewdale. Use local suppliers and employ local personnel where possible.	85.2%	Option A – 2 Option B – 2	2
All requirements have been met.								

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price Ranking	Qualitative Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in completing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Graffiti Force Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	In operation for 3 yrs with 12 technicians and 4 management staff. Experience & skills of key personnel provided plus list of 6 spray units. They have a safety policy & procedures in place.	Demonstrated some experience in providing services similar to the scope & volume of the City's contract.	Demonstrated a good understanding of the required tasks. Provided a breakdown of each method of graffiti removal plus reporting.	Are located in Morley. They have an environmental policy & are involved in a community service order programme involving offenders in the removal of graffiti.	75.1%	Option A – 4 Option B – 3	3
FCT Surface Cleaning All requirements have been met.	Yes	In operation for 14 years with 13 FTE's and several part-time staff. Skills & experience of key personnel detailed. Equipment not listed, but referred to in methodology. Provided brief safety policy.	Demonstrated experience in removal of graffiti for various organisations. Information supplied was lacking in detail and did not provide sufficient information about scope and volume of work	Provided a brief methodology for 6 different surfaces. No response addressing reporting.	Are located in Osborne Park. They have a clean capture recycle machine for recycling of water on surface cleaning.	59.2%	Option A – 6 Option B – 7	4

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price Ranking	Qualitative Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in completing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
West Aus Graffiti Removal	Yes	A small company in operation since July 2007. They have 4 staff. Only 1 employee appears to work fulltime in graffiti removal. They also have 2 subcontractors. Did not demonstrate sufficient capacity to meet the City's scope and volume of work.	Did not demonstrate experience in work of a similar scope & volume to the City's requirements.	No specific response was provided. No specific methodology provided for graffiti removal methods. Did not demonstrate understanding of the City's requirements.	Are located in Iluka. They use local suppliers & offer free of charge graffiti removal for places of worship and charities within the City boundaries.	50.7%	Option A – 3 Option B – 5	5
All requirements have been met.								
JVR Surface Cleaning	Yes	In operation since February 2009. Has 1 field agent plus 2 admin staff. Insufficient evidence of field agent experience. Have sufficient equipment for 1 operator & have 1 subcontractor. Did not demonstrate sufficient capacity	Did not demonstrate experience in work of a similar scope and volume to the City's requirements.	Demonstrated a general understanding of graffiti removal with a brief statement addressing paint-out & chemical graffiti removal. Have concerns of their understanding of the scope & volume of work required by City.	Are located in Tapping. They utilise local suppliers where possible and offer free of charge graffiti removal for places of worship and charities within the City boundaries.	44%	Option A – 5 Option B – 4	6
All requirements have been met.								

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price Ranking	Qualitative Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in completing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>The Trustee for Mesics Drilling Trust T/as Quick Smart Enviro Clean</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	In operation since November 2008 with 1 FTE and 2 casual staff providing graffiti removal. No documented skills or experience for staff other than owner undertaking training in dry ice/ peel away methods. Did not demonstrate ownership of any traditional graffiti removal equipment.	Are a new company. Provided references for demonstrations of 2 removal methods only. Do not have any established contracts.	Demonstrated an understanding of graffiti removal in general, but did not adequately address suitability of their processes on specific surface types & locations.	Are located in Jayne Brook. Removal methods stated as environmentally friendly using no chemicals, however disposal of material not addressed.	35%	Option A – 7 Option B – 6	7
<p>Top That! Executive Cleaning Services</p> <p>Did not address selection criteria. Only offered graffiti paint-out method</p>	No	-	-	-	-	-	-	

PRICE ASSESSMENT

No. Years	Penalty/Bonus Scenario	Graffiti Systems Australia	West Aus Graffiti Removal	Quick Smart Enviro Clean	JVR Surface Cleaning	FCT Surface Cleaning	Kleenit	Graffiti Force Pty Ltd
Option A (Exclusive of Penalty/Bonus Arrangement)								
1 Year	n/a	\$254,599	\$683,780	\$1,091,138	\$727,425	\$951,472	\$397,174	\$712,877
5 Years	n/a	\$1,363,194	\$3,664,767	\$5,850,679	\$3,901,180	\$5,100,704	\$2,129,173	\$3,821,891
Option B (Inclusive of Penalty/Bonus Arrangement)								
1 Year	Maximum penalty applied (did not meet target for 12 months)	\$236,340	\$787,801	\$898,370	\$760,159	\$948,126	\$377,315	\$677,233
	Maximum bonus applied (Met target for 12 months)	\$261,218	\$870,728	\$992,935	\$840,176	\$1,047,928	\$417,033	\$748,520
5 Years	Minimum cost of Contract over 5 yrs with maximum penalty applied each year	\$1,267,367	\$4,224,557	\$4,817,478	\$4,076,327	\$5,084,292	\$2,023,341	\$3,631,637
	Maximum cost of Contract over 5 yrs with maximum bonus applied each year	\$1,400,774	\$4,669,248	\$5,324,581	\$4,505,414	\$5,619,481	\$2,236,324	\$3,265,394

Note: The rates offered by West Aus Graffiti Removal and Quick Smart Enviro Clean were different for each graffiti removal method. For the purposes of this evaluation, their lowest rate (graffiti paint-out) was used in the above calculations. It is not possible to predict which removal method is used more frequently as it is entirely dependent on the graffiti type and surface it has been applied to.