

## SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price Rank	Qualitative Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Devco Holdings Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	In business since 1986, with 11 employees & 35 sub-contractors. Provided org chart & details on all personnel. Included comprehensive safety policy & management plan & list of equipment. Additional resources supplied from sub-contractors.	Comprehensive list of similar projects supplied. All included scope, dates and value. Works included renovations, new construction & re-roofing. They completed Ellersdale & Timberlane Park Clubrooms renovations for City in 2008.	Response addressed working in occupied community buildings and working around children. A sample Gantt chart and site meeting minutes supported their work methodology.	They would source goods & services in local area and have several employees living in City. The business is located in Wangara.	77.5%	2	1
RWE Robinson & Sons Pty Ltd T/as Robinson Buildtech All requirements have been met.	Yes	In operation since 1958 with 50+ employees. Provided org chart & details on key personnel. Included safety policy & management plan & list of equipment. Additional resources supplied from in-house staff.	Long list of similar projects supplied. All included scope, dates and value. Works included renovations, new construction. Value of woks ranges from \$62,000 to \$4 <sup>+</sup> million. All current listed projects have values exceeding \$1 million.	Did not provide specific response to criterion, general statements in company profile referred to different types of projects & resource allocation.	Located in Myaree. Will use Joondalup based businesses for supplies and have a tradesman in Karrinyup for quick response calls.	72%	3	2

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price Rank	Qualitative Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Knebworth Building Co. Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	Established in 1988 with 14 employees & 10 sub-contractors. Provided org chart & details on 5 personnel. Included comprehensive safety management plan No list of equipment supplied. Additional resources supplied from employees & sub-contractors.	Demonstrated good level of experience in completing similar projects. 7 examples were supplied. Each listed the scope & outcome of the project. All contained elements of similarity to the City's requirements.	The methodology supplied addressed the general requirements of the works to be undertaken.	Located in Inglewood. They will use local businesses and equipment hire. 20% of their employees live in the City of Joondalup.	63.8%	6	3
Q Contracting Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	In operation since 2000 with 15 employees. Provided experience & length of service for 5 personnel. Included safety management plan Brief list of equipment supplied. Additional resources supplied from employees.	Demonstrated experience in completing similar projects with a list of 5 similar projects supplied. Scope varied from replacement of vinyl flooring to roofing & concrete repair.	A one sentence response provided to criterion. Insufficient detail to assess their understanding of the requirements.	Based in Myaree. They will use and purchase goods from local businesses and have staff living in the City area.	58.3%	7	4

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price Rank	Qualitative Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
KMC Group All requirements have been met.	Yes	In operation 20+ years with unknown number of employees. Chart of relationship to City was supplied with CV's of 3 managers. No list of equipment supplied. Additional resources not addressed. A brief safety plan was supplied.	A list of 6 projects was provided supporting their experience. These included additions, alterations and refurbishment works. Response was lacking in detail.	Demonstrated a sufficient level of understanding of requirements. A work process for construction was supplied addressing criterion.	They are located in Willetton. They will use local tradespeople and suppliers where possible and 1 supervisor lives in the City of Joondalup.	57.2%	5	5
PRC Building Services Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	A subsidiary of Perth Roofing Co. in operation independently for 2 years with 35 employees. An org chart and information on 7 of their employees was supplied together with examples of their equipment. Additional resources was not addressed.	They demonstrated sufficient experience in completing similar projects such as roof replacements, refurbishments and maintenance services.	Demonstrated a good understanding of the requirements with their response addressing JSA's. staffing, communication, equipment and trades.	Based in Bayswater. They would purchase materials from local businesses and would seek to employ people in the City.	56%	4	6

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price Rank	Qualitative Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>CPD Group Pty Ltd</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	In operation since 1994 with 40 employees. Provided org chart & information on 5 key personnel. Included safety management plan. No list of equipment supplied. Additional resources not addressed. A sample safety management plan was supplied.	A list of multiple projects completed for 3 organisations including the City. The contracts ranged from 2008 to present. Insufficient information was supplied on the scope of works to ascertain their similarity to the City's requirements.	Demonstrated sufficient understanding of the requirements with their methodology addressing the refurbishment work process, program management & nomination of employees to the City's contract.	Located in Burswood. They will employ staff & subcontractors from the local area.	55.4%	1	7
<p>Walcott Industries Pty Ltd</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	Number of years in operation is unknown with the company having 5 employees & 3 main sub-contractors. The roles & experience of personnel was supplied. No list of equipment or response to additional resources was included. A construction safety plan was supplied.	This criterion was not addressed in a sufficient manner. 6 sample quotation documents were supplied. No information was supplied addressing whether the works were undertaken or completed.	A very brief response was supplied to this criterion which addressed submitting a quote, timetable, issue of work order and development of a safety plan.	They are located in Mullaloo. They use local tradespeople and businesses where possible.	39%	8	8

Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Price Rank	Qualitative Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Robert Parker Homes All requirements have been met.	Yes	In operation since 2005 with an unknown number of employees. No org chart was supplied. The experience & role of 2 employees were included. Response did not address equipment or additional resources. A safety handbook was included.	An exhaustive list of projects was supplied; however no scope was supplied for any other than a value. It was unclear if any of the projects are similar to the City's requirements.	The response to this criterion did not provide any specific methodology for completing projects of a similar nature.	Located in Mundaring. Response addressed a drain on residential building and the benefits of engaging a builder from outside the Joondalup area.	36.5%	9	9
Quality Group Services T/as Arrix Constructions All requirements have been met.	Yes	In operation since 2001 with an unknown number of employees. No information provided of their organisational structure other than the CV of 1 project manager. No information supplied for their equipment, after-hrs contact or ability to supply extra resources. A portion of their safety handbook was supplied.	Insufficient information was supplied to ascertain whether any the list of projects supplied is similar to the City's requirements and how recently they were completed.	No response was supplied for this criterion.	No response was supplied for this criterion.  They are located in Osborne Park.	25.7%	2	10