SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS

	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria						
Respondent & Description of Response		Capacity	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
Downer EDI Works Pty Ltd Offer subject to 14 amendments to contract conditions	Partially	It has operated in WA since 1968 with 656 staff in its WA civil division. A breakdown of staff in each WA location was supplied with an organisational chart. This was supported by the role, experience, qualifications and CVs of four key staff. A list of equipment to be used on the project was provided. The project manager was nominated for after hours support and additional resources would be sourced in-house or through subcontractors. The company operates an AS/NZS 4801:2001 OHS management system.	Downer EDI Works Pty Ltd demonstrated extensive experience completing similar projects. 12 example projects demonstrated its experience. The company is the current contractor to the City of Perth for minor civil construction and maintenance works. Other examples of completed works were for the Cities of Melville and Wanneroo and Main Roads. The referees supplied are the Cities of Melville, Perth and Wanneroo.	Downer EDI Works Pty Ltd demonstrated a thorough understanding of the project. A methodology specific to the project was supplied. This addressed site mobilisation and preparation, delineation of work areas, earthworks, road surfacing and site management. A provisional program was also included. No allowance has been made in the Offer for inclement weather and the program nominated a provisional delay period of five weeks.	The company will source locally for sub-contractors and use local suppliers where possible. The company's WA office is located in Redcliffe.	69.7%	\$990,205	1

TENDER 018/12 OCEANSIDE PROMENADE ROAD CONSTRUCTION UPGRADE

		Comment Against Criteria						
Respondent & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
Curnow Group Pty Ltd Offer subject to retention monies in place of bank guarantee & limit of liquidated damages to 5% of contract sum.	Partially	It has been in operation since 2009 with 26 staff. An organisational chart was supplied listing 13 key staff plus operators, crew leaders and labour groups. This was supported by the role, experience and qualifications of 12 employees. A list of all the equipment held by the company was supplied which meets the project requirements. After-hours contact, additional resources and personnel were supplied upon clarification. A safety management plan and safety record for 2010 to 2011 was supplied				62%	\$875,106	2
		with various additional safety and health policies	Carnarvon, EPRA/ NS Projects and Cardno BSD.					

TENDER 018/12 OCEANSIDE PROMENADE ROAD CONSTRUCTION UPGRADE

	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria						
Respondent & Description of Response		Capacity	Demonstrated experience completing similar projects	Demonstrated understanding of the requirements	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Price	Rank
Neo Infrastructure (Aust) Pty Ltd Offer subject to fortnightly payment terms, limit on liquidated damages to 10% of contact sum, extended working hours and variation terms.	Partially	It has been in operation since 2009 with an unknown total number of staff. 8 staff plus construction workers were set out on the supplied organisational chart. CVs were also supplied for four key personnel. A brief list of equipment was listed on the provisional program. The submission did not address after-hours contact or the ability to provide additional resources and personnel. The company's risk management policy was supplied; however no safety record or procedures were submitted.	It did not demonstrate sufficient experience completing projects of a similar nature. The 11 example projects supplied. included bridge works, coastal drainage works, subdivisional roads and works on rural roads. Although they were civil projects, no project demonstrated experience completing road works in a high volume traffic area. Referees included: AECOM, VDM Consulting and the Cities of Onkaparinga and Marion in SA & the City of Gosnells.	The company did not demonstrate sufficient understanding of the project. A provisional program was supplied which set out the main tasks of the project; however no written methodology was provided. The company proposed an extended range of working hours not in accordance with those set out in the specification. The evaluation panel is not confident that the company understands the restriction of working hours for the project due to the use of facilities in the vicinity and volume of traffic in peak periods.	No response was supplied for this criterion. The company is located in Wangara.	30%	\$628,000	3