APPENDIX 16

TENDER 012/15 EXTENSION AND REFURBISHMENT OF ILUKA SPORTS COMPLEX

SUMMARY OF TENDER SUBMISSIONS

ATTACHMENT 1

Tenderer &	ls it		Comment Against Criteria					Rank
-	Compliant? Yes or No	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Capacity	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
The Trustee for Devereux Family Trust (Devco Builders)	Yes	It has been in the building construction and refurbishment	It was established in 1986. It currently employs 11 staff. The	It demonstrated a thorough understanding of the	It is located in Wangara. It has several staff	81.7%	\$403,118	n/a
All requirements have been met.		industry for many years. Numerous examples of works were provided and these included additions and internal refurbishments to existing clubrooms for the Cities of Bayswater (Halliday Park completed 2010), Swan (Altone Pavilion completed 2011) and Belmont (Centenary Park completed 2014). It has in the past completed a number of similar projects for the City.	business structure and details of key personnel including their experience and role were provided. Details of specialised equipment that will be used to carry out the works were supplied. It has emergency after-hours services and the ability to provide additional personnel and resources if required. It operates with its own quality management system and has a safety policy in place. Copies of its safety management plan and statistics were provided.	City's requirements. It has been undertaking building refurbishment works for the City over eight years and has previously carried out building and maintenance works onsite at the Iluka Sports Complex. It stated it will complete works as per its construction program, Australian Standards, Building Code of Australia (BCA), plans provided, specifications, legislation relevant to the job and its subcontractors.	including its director reside within the City. One of its subcontractors, Hire Guys, is located in Joondalup.			

Tenderer & Description of Response	ls it		Comment Against Criteria					Rank
	Compliant? Yes or No	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Capacity	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	[−] Score		
Hickey Constructions Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It has recently completed building refurbishment works for the Cities of Bayswater and Wanneroo. Numerous other examples of works were provided and these included similar projects undertaken in the past by its managing director (previously a construction manager for Devco Builders (2010 – 2014).	It commenced operation from May 2014. It has four employees. Its company structure and details of key personnel including their experience were provided. Specialised equipment that will be used to complete the works, after-hours contacts for emergency requirements and the ability to provide additional personnel if required were not addressed. It operates with its own quality management system and has a safety policy in place. A copy of its safety policy was provided. The company's safety statistics were not supplied.	It demonstrated a thorough understanding of the City's requirements. Its proposed construction methodology included an outline of tasks to be carried out, from site establishment to demolition and alteration works, structural certification and project handover. A Gantt chart was provided.	It is located in Yanchep. It indicated most of its subcontractors and suppliers were from the Joondalup and Wanneroo area.	60.5%	Failed to mee acceptable so Tendered lun sum price is \$450,875.	core.

Tenderer &	ls it	Comment Against Criteria					Lump Sum	Rank
	Compliant? Yes or No	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Capacity	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Score		
Safeway Building and Renovations Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It demonstrated experience in completing similar projects. Examples of works included building refurbishment works for the City of Swan (Ballajura Community Centre and Baskerville Memorial Hall both completed 2013) and campground upgrade for the Rottnest Island Authority (currently under construction). Other past projects and references were provided and most were for re-roof works.	It was established in 2004. It has 35 fulltime employees. Its organisation profile and details of key personnel including their qualifications and experience were provided. Details of some specialised equipment that will be used to carry out the works were supplied. After-hours contacts and the ability to provide additional staff and resources if required were addressed. It has its own quality management system and a safety policy in place. A safety statement was provided. The company has had no incidents to date.	It demonstrated a sound understanding of the required tasks. Its proposed methodology included an outline of tasks to be undertaken for site/construction works and finishing trades. A Gantt chart and a schedule of estimated monthly progress were supplied.	It is based in Mandurah. It stated, if successful, the company will support local businesses where possible.	59.0%	Failed to mee acceptable so Tendered lun sum price is \$466,500.	core.

Tenderer &	ls it	Comment Against Criteria					Lump Sum	Rank
	Compliant? Yes or No	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Capacity	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
A Corp Construction Pty Ltd	Yes	It has completed building extension	It was established in 2011. It currently	It demonstrated some understanding of the	It is located in Joondalup.	58.4%	Failed to mee acceptable so	
All requirements have been met.		and refurbishment works for Mandurah Retirement Village Inc (completed 2014), design/construct of administration building incorporating existing administration building for the Shire of Boddington (completed 2014) and construction of the new Goldfields Equestrian Centre facilities for the City of Kalgoorlie Boulder (completed 2013).	employs 10 fulltime staff. Its organisational structure and details of key personnel including their qualifications and experience were provided. It holds basic equipment and hires major plant on a project by project basis. It did not address the ability to provide additional personnel and resources if required and after-hours contacts for emergency requirements. It operates with its own quality management system and has a safety policy in place. A copy of its safety policy was supplied. It has had no lost time injuries to date.	City's requirements. Whilst a Gantt chart and a method statement were provided, information on its proposed construction methodology was limited.	It indicated several of its employees reside in Joondalup. It supports local businesses and sporting clubs.		Tendered lun sum price is \$629,910.	np

Tenderer & Description of Response	ls it		Comment Against Criteria					Rank
	Compliant? Yes or No	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Capacity	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	[−] Score		
LKS Constructions (WA) Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It demonstrated experience in completing similar projects. Examples of works were provided however a number of these were for access upgrades for train stations and car parks for the Public Transport Authority (completed in 2012 and 2014). Other examples included refurbishment works for the City of Perth (Cultural Centre Fiji Room upgrades completed 2011) and Town of Claremont (scout hall office fit out in 2011).	It has been operating since 2010. It has 19 full time staff. Its structure of business was not provided. Details of key personnel including their qualifications and experience were supplied. Specialised equipment that will be used and the ability to provide additional personnel if required were not addressed. Afterhours contacts for emergency requirements were provided. It has an accredited quality management system and a safety policy in place. Copies of its safety procedures and statistics were supplied.	It demonstrated a sound understanding of the required tasks. Its Submission included a Gantt chart and an outline of tasks to be carried out, from pre- mobilisation to site establishment and constructions (demolition, hydraulics, brickwork, roof structure, interior and site works).	Its head office is based in Malaga and the company also operates from its Fremantle branch. One of its subcontractors resides in Greenwood.	56.5%	Failed to mee acceptable so Tendered lun sum price is \$574,800.	core.

	ls it	Comment Against Criteria					Lump Sum	Rank
Description of Response	Compliant? Yes or No	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Capacity	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Score		
Adrina Project Management Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes		It was established in South Africa in 1961 and commenced operation in Australia in the mid 1990s. Its WA office is located in Mindarie and has 13 full time staff. Its organisation structure and details of key personnel including their experience and role were provided. Specialised equipment, afterhours contacts for emergency requirements and the ability to provide additional personnel if required were not addressed. It operates with its own quality management system and has a safety policy in place. A copy of its safety management plan was supplied. Its	It did not submit a response specifically though a Gantt chart was supplied.	Its WA office is located in Mindarie. Two of its subcontractors are based in the Joondalup area. Most of its employees live in the City or within the immediate area.	38.1%	Failed to mea acceptable s Tendered lur sum price is \$421,601.	core.

Tenderer & Description of Response	ls it	Comment Against Criteria					Lump Sum	Rank
	Compliant? Yes or No	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Capacity	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
ZD Constructions 93 Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It demonstrated some experience in completing similar projects. Examples of works were provided and these included alterations/additions and refurbishments carried out for the City of South Perth (animal care facility completed 2014, operations centre completed 2014 and scouts hall completed 2012).	It was formed in 1993. It operates with its own quality management system. Details of proposed key personnel including their qualifications and years of experience were provided. Its structure of business, the number of full time employees, specialised equipment, the ability to provide additional personnel if required, afterhours contacts for emergency requirements and safety were not addressed.	It submitted a brief response and did not address any of the criteria specifically to demonstrate its understanding of the City's requirements. The proposed methodology and approach, including timeframes were not supplied.	It is located in South Perth. It did not submit a response.	23.0%	Failed to mee acceptable so Tendered lun sum price is \$430,044.	core.

Tenderer &	ls it		Evaluation	Lump Sum	Rank			
	Compliant? Yes or No	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Capacity	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
R E Asset Logistics Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It submitted a general response and did not include examples of works to demonstrate experience in completing similar projects.	It is part of Pyramid Group (Aust) Pty Ltd which offers integrated services to the property development, management and construction markets. A date or when the company was formed and the number of employees were not supplied. However, the Group structure was provided. Details of key personnel, specialised equipment, the ability to provide additional personnel if required and afterhours contacts for emergency requirements were not addressed. It has its own quality management system and a safety policy in place. A copy of its safety procedures was supplied. Its safety statistics were not provided.	It did not submit a response.	It is located in Osborne Park. It did not submit a response.	18.0%	Failed to mee acceptable so Tendered lun sum price is \$489,810.	core.