

SUMMARY OF SUBMISSIONS

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant ? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Fixed Lump Sum	Rank
		Demonstrated experience completing community sporting facility construction projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>The Trustee for Devereux Family Trust (Devco Builders)</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	<p>Devco demonstrated considerable experience completing refurbishment projects for various government agencies. Examples of work included successfully completing the Sorrento Soccer Club refurbishment project for the City in February 2018 - \$776,000. Others projects included change room modifications and upgrades of the Charles Veryard Pavilion for the City of Vincent - \$55,000 and upgrade of AFLW Player Facilities at Leederville Oval for the City of Vincent - \$160,000. Works included, removal of existing fixtures and fittings, kitchen refurbishments, electrical upgrades and painting works.</p>	<p>It demonstrated a thorough understanding of the City's requirements by providing a logical description of the construction method. It proposed seven subcontractors to work with them who it has worked with in the past and all had relevant experience with previous projects. All subcontractors have an understanding government contracts and hold necessary licences/registrations/qualifications to carry out and provide the services specified in the tender. A basic Gantt Chart was provided identifying tasks, start and finish dates and duration. A schedule of estimated monthly progress claims showing percentage only was provided.</p>	<p>Devco was established in 1986. It is located in Wangara and currently has 20 full time and 5 casual employees. It provided an organisation structure and details of key personnel (General Manager, Site Supervisor, Tradesmen, etc.) including qualification, length in service and industry experience. The company has sufficient capacity to undertake the works.</p>	<p>Devco stated they have several employees who reside in the City of Joondalup and it sponsors Warwick Greenwood Junior Football Club and Warwick Greenwood Junior Cricket Club. It engages local subcontractors and receives goods from local suppliers in the Joondalup Industrial area, including; Reeces Plumbing, CSR Gyprock, Bunnings, Kennards Hire, etc.</p>	71.2%	\$757,274	1

## Tender 002/20 - ELLERSDALE PARK CLUBROOM EXTENSION AND REFURBISHMENT

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant ? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Fixed Lump Sum	Rank
		Demonstrated experience completing community sporting facility construction projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Hickey Constructions Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	Hickey demonstrated extensive experience completing community sporting facilities for local governments, including completion of the Mildenhall Senior Citizen Centre (new kitchen, electrical upgrade works, roofing works and asbestos removal) for the City - \$220,000 - June 2020. Other examples of similar works recently completed were Duncraig Community Hall (Refurbishment to existing facility) for the City - \$300,000 - March 2020, Falkland Park (Construction of new amenities building) for the City - \$600,000 - April 2020 and Abbeville Park Clubrooms (Construction of new store rooms and kiosk area) for the City of Wanneroo - August 2019.	Hickey demonstrated a very good understanding of the required tasks, outlined in its extensive method statement for proposed construction. A Gantt Chart was provided proposing a works to be completed within 130 days, with tasks and milestones indicated. It listed 9 subcontractors proposed to be used on the project with trades such as electrical, mechanical, structural steel, concrete, roofing, floor finishes, painting, windows and ceilings. A schedule of estimated monthly progress claims showing percentage and expected contract values was provided.	Hickey Constructions has been in operation since 2014. It is based in Yanchep and has 6 full time employees. The structure of business and details of key personnel was provided along with a detailed list of specialised equipment. After-hours contacts were included and it indicated that additional resources were available if required. It has the capacity required to carry out the works in terms of personnel and resources.	Hickey Construction's head office is in Yanchep and currently lease a storage unit in the City. Currently it has 2 employees living in the City. As it currently holds the maintenance and minor works contract for the City, it regularly sources materials and equipment from within the City. A list of suppliers based in the City used was provided.	68.8%	\$733,176	2

## Tender 002/20 - ELLERSDALE PARK CLUBROOM EXTENSION AND REFURBISHMENT

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant ? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Fixed Lump Sum	Rank
		Demonstrated experience completing community sporting facility construction projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Geared Construction Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	Geared Construction Pty Ltd demonstrated extensive experience in completing projects with similar scope of work for state and local government agencies. It listed five projects in detail, including; the Coolbinia Clubroom Refurbishment (City of Stirling – \$550,000 - 2017), Aquamotion Upgrade (City of Wanneroo - \$560,000 - 2018), Millington Reserve Clubrooms Refurbishment (City of Stirling - \$600,000 - 2018), WSSC Greenkeepers Facility (City of Wanneroo - \$300,000 - 2018), Dryandra Reserve Clubrooms (City of Stirling - \$360,000 - 2019). It also successfully completed the Sorrento Tennis Club Refurbishment for the City in August 2018.	The company provided a thorough understanding of the requirements with a conclusive approach to the construction methodology. It outlined the tasks to be undertaken to complete the works, from communication and programming of the works through to commissioning and handover. A Gantt Chart was provided showing a clear working methodology. It provided a list of 15 subcontractors for multiple services it proposed for the works who it has worked with (except two) over the last 3 years. Geared Construction Pty Ltd has quality assurance certification or quality management system in place. A schedule of estimated monthly progress claims/cash flow forecast was provided.	The company has been in business since April 2016 and its core business is construction, refurbishment and maintenance. Its principal location is Gnangara and currently has 8 full time and 2 part time employees. Details of its proposed management team allocated to this project with their experience, qualifications and role was provided, but did not provide after hours contacts for emergency requirements. Geared Construction Pty Ltd has the industry experience and proven capacity to complete the works.	Geared Construction Pty Ltd employs 2 local residents and will try to source materials locally. Some of its subcontractors are from the City and it sponsors the youth community teams at Joondalup Utd Football Club.	64.1%	\$683,440	3

## Tender 002/20 - ELLERSDALE PARK CLUBROOM EXTENSION AND REFURBISHMENT

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant ? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Fixed Lump Sum	Rank
		Demonstrated experience completing community sporting facility construction projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Marawar Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	<p>Marawar provided experience details and documentation for projects that have some similarities to this requirement, but there were no Sporting Facility projects. Numerous examples were supplied supporting its experience and these included: Office fit-out of the WA Indigenous Business Employment Hub (Wirrpanda Foundation - project value \$272,207, - January 2020), Kitchen Refurbishments (Spotless - project value \$285,175, completed in September 2019), Replacement of five roofs at Winterfold Primary School (M Construction (WA) Pty Ltd - project value \$379,650 - January 2020), Animal Night Quarter Upgrade (Perth Zoo - project value \$94,074 - September 2019) and Refurbishment of ESC and AAT Toilets at Merriwa Primary School (Programmed Facility Management - project value \$71,578 - January 2020).</p>	<p>Marawar demonstrated a good understanding of the required tasks and proposed an appropriate methodology for the project and an acceptable Gantt Chart. It provided a list of subcontractors, however there was no indication on how long they had worked together nor whether they have used them previously.</p> <p>The company does not have quality assurance certification or quality management system in place. A schedule of estimated monthly progress claims was not provided.</p>	<p>The company was established in 2018 and is part of the M/Group with its principal location in West Leederville. It employs a diverse range of 20 staff with multi-cultural backgrounds and various skills. A detailed organisational chart and detailing of staff experience and qualifications was provided. An after hours contact was provided but no data on the ability to provide additional personnel and resources. The company has the capacity required to undertake the works.</p>	<p>The company stated that a few of its employees live within the City and it will aim to use (if successful) as many material/service suppliers that are locals of the City. Being part of M/Group, Marawar supports and sponsors the Sorrento Football Club.</p>	59.7%	\$791,488	4

## Tender 002/20 - ELLERSDALE PARK CLUBROOM EXTENSION AND REFURBISHMENT

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant ? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Fixed Lump Sum	Rank
		Demonstrated experience completing community sporting facility construction projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
BE Projects All requirements have been met.	Yes	BE Projects demonstrated a good level of experience completing renovations and additions to community facilities for Local Government and private organisations. Periods, values and dates of contracts were included. Three project examples were supplied were, Middleton Park Clubrooms Alterations and Additions - City of Belmont - Value: \$480,000 - 2020, Canning Vale College Additions - Building Management and Works - Value: \$2,707,277 - 2019, St Augustine's Church Re-Development - Value: \$936,089 - 2016 and Goomalling Sporting Pavilion - Shire of Goomalling - Value: \$ 3,081,000 - 2016. Other projects were listed but many of a larger scale than this tender and with much higher values.	The company demonstrated its understanding of the required tasks by providing a methodology statement addressing overall construction, work packages, site management, key risks and the like. However the reference to site inspection location was incorrect and its reference to arranging new building permits and other relevant permits are not required. A detailed Gantt Chart including start and finish dates for each activity and number of working days was provided.	BE Projects, located in Burswood, was established in 2010. It did not provide the number of employees. It provided an organisational chart and skills of relevant personnel and stated it has additional personnel available if required. The company demonstrated it has the capacity required to undertake the works, although it did not indicate its number of employees.	It stated that one of its electrical subcontractors lives the City. No other reference was made to this criterion.	59.6%	\$812,554	5

## Tender 002/20 - ELLERSDALE PARK CLUBROOM EXTENSION AND REFURBISHMENT

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant ? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Fixed Lump Sum	Rank
		Demonstrated experience completing community sporting facility construction projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>The Trustee for M R Hoskins Family Trust (A E Hoskins Building Services)</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	<p>The company has completed refurbishments, civil works and building extensions for WA local governments and private organisations. It listed several sporting facility and civil projects with similar scope: Butlers Reserve Clubroom - alterations and additions (City of Stirling - value \$665,118 - April 2019), Kent Street Extension – demolition and renovation (Town of Victoria Park - value \$493,823 - February 2018), Bethanie Geneff Aged Care Home - extension of three separate accommodation wings (Bethanie Group - value \$738,731 - March 2020) and Des Penman Sporting Pavilion - renovation and refurbishment of the existing facilities (City of Stirling - value \$1,199,838 - 2020).</p>	<p>It demonstrated some understanding of the requirements and provided a proposed methodology.</p> <p>The company demonstrated some understanding of the requirements and provided a proposed methodology and approach, however the submission made some incorrect project references to the description of the works, replacing the existing tiled roof (roof not tiled) and the new sewer connection was not mentioned. A list of subcontractors was included but most have not worked for the company in the past 3 years. It has quality assurance certification or quality management system in place. A schedule of estimated monthly progress claims with percentage and forecasted values was provided.</p>	<p>A E Hoskins Building Services has been in operation since 1911. It is based in Balcatta and has 94 employees (70 trade staff). It provided a key personnel chart for the project with qualifications and experience listed. After-hours emergency contact details was provided and it stated it has the additional contingency resources required to complete the requirements of all contracts.</p>	<p>It did not address this criterion directly but stated that some of its subcontractors are based in the City.</p>	56.4%	\$731,012	6

## Tender 002/20 - ELLERSDALE PARK CLUBROOM EXTENSION AND REFURBISHMENT

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant ? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Fixed Lump Sum	Rank
		Demonstrated experience completing community sporting facility construction projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>Renascent Western Australia Pty Ltd</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	<p>Renascent demonstrated some experience completing refurbishment and upgrade projects, but not refurbishment of a clubroom. Its works mostly includes high end specifications. It provided details of 4 projects of varying scopes including, 81 St Georges Terrace, Perth - Building Extension - extension of the front of the building (Knight Frank - August 2020 - \$1,100,000), McDonald's Morley - Building Extension - 4 phase stage of demolition, construction and fitout (RAH Nominees - April 2020 - \$281,000), Victory Life Church - Building Extension - construction of a new Prayer Tower and new foyer area (ESS Super - ongoing - \$2,800,000) and CEO Institute - conversion of top floor apartments into an exclusive meeting and events space (CEO Institute - October 2019 - \$703,000).</p>	<p>Renascent provided an adequate understanding of the requirements. It provided an acceptable methodology that included key project deliverables and an overall project methodology. It listed 18 subcontractors however some of the subcontractors they have not worked with in the last 3 years and others have not previously worked with them. A detailed Gantt Chart with acceptable timelines was provided. Renascent has quality assurance certification or quality management system in place. A schedule of estimated monthly progress claims/ forecast statement was not provided.</p>	<p>Renascent was founded in 1996 in Leichhardt, NSW and operates in WA from its office in the Perth CBD. It has 140 staff nationally and provided a structure of its business with details, skills and qualification of relevant personnel. After hours contact details were provided and it has the ability to pull on additional personnel and resources if required. The company demonstrated the capacity required to undertake the works.</p>	<p>The company stated that its Site Manager and Contract Administrator (amongst other staff members) are residents within the City of Joondalup. Renascent stated that it and its subcontractors will support local businesses wherever possible.</p>	54.0%	\$870,566	7

## Tender 002/20 - ELLERSDALE PARK CLUBROOM EXTENSION AND REFURBISHMENT

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant ? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Fixed Lump Sum	Rank
		Demonstrated experience completing community sporting facility construction projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
CASL Construction Pty Ltd (Castle Projects) All requirements have been met.	Yes	Castle Projects has undertaken many construction projects that encompass similar trades that will be required for completing this project, however the company was not involved in the refurbishment of any clubroom facilities nor any Local Government projects. Examples of works included a new Op Shop, Meeting Hall for The Church of the Way – June 2019 - \$800,000, a new early learning centre for the Mandurah Baptist College – December 2019 - \$5,400,000 and a new head office and educational facility for the Alta-1 College – January 2020 - \$3,000,000.	Castle Projects demonstrated a good understanding of the tender requirements are for the successful delivery of the project. Its method of construction is acceptable and relevant to the site. A list of eight subcontractors with previous experience and an acceptable Gantt Chart was provided and it stated that it does intend to subcontract all or part of the works. The company does not have quality assurance certification or quality management system in place. A schedule of estimated monthly progress claims in the form of a Cash Flow "S" graph statement was provided.	The company is located in Leederville. It did not fully demonstrate it had the capacity required to carry out the works, it offered limited information on its business history, number of employees or infrastructure and no after hours contact details were evident.	One of its current subcontractors is based within the City boundary and it will engage more if successful. Two of its employees reside in the City. It would be keen to sponsor a local sports team that uses the Ellersdale Park Clubroom.	50.1%	\$835,909	8



## Tender 002/20 - ELLERSDALE PARK CLUBROOM EXTENSION AND REFURBISHMENT

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant ? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Fixed Lump Sum	Rank
		Demonstrated experience completing community sporting facility construction projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Construct360 Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	Construct360 did not demonstrate sufficient experience completing projects of a similar nature. It provided details of numerous refurbishments projects for various clients, but no sporting facility projects were identified. It demonstrated experience with the following, South Metropolitan TAFE - major training facility for Programmed Facility Management – 2019 - \$1,560,810, Hazelmere Hall - refurbishment works for City of Swan – 2018 - \$310,000, NM TAFE Perth Campus - Upgrade of Toilet Facilities for Programmed Facility Management – 2018 - \$415,000. It stated it is an approved preferred panel contractor for the “Minister of Finance WA”, the “Department of Education WA” and other local governments.	It provided a management methodology which referred to the wrong client and project. A Gantt Chart provided a timeframe for the construction but overall was not very informative. A list of subcontractors was provided however there were no details of previous experience, commitments and financials and most of the subcontractors have not worked for the company in the last 3 years. Construct360 Pty has quality assurance certification or quality management system in place. A schedule of estimated monthly progress claims showing percentage only was provided.	Construct360 began its operations in 2016 and is currently located in Landsdale. It provided an organisational structure and details of the team with advice that 2 direct employees would be onsite with 30 sub-contractors. It did not provide number of employees.	The company stated it has a number of employees residing within the City boundaries and always contribute to the Social and Economic benefits to the local community and ensure where possible the utilisation of sub-contractors and suppliers located within the City.	49.9%	\$614,000	9

## Tender 002/20 - ELLERSDALE PARK CLUBROOM EXTENSION AND REFURBISHMENT

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant ? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Fixed Lump Sum	Rank
		Demonstrated experience completing community sporting facility construction projects	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
LKS Constructions (WA) Pty Ltd	No	Non-compliant not assessed. LKS did not attend the mandatory site briefing.						
All requirements have not been met.								