SUMMARY OF SUBMISSIONS

		Comment Against Criteria					Fatimento d	
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience in providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
Quayclean Australia Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It has been delivering cleaning services for aquatic and leisure facilities across Australia over the past 18 years. It currently employs over 1,800 permanent, parttime and casual staff nationally. It has 180 fulltime, part-time and casual staff in its WA office. Its structure of business and details of key personnel including their roles and experience were provided. An overview of specialised equipment, with pictures and where these equipment will be used in leisure facility areas were supplied. Though quantity or condition of the proposed equipment was not stated, it outlined its intention to purchase the equipment required within one month of award of contract. After hours contact details for emergency requirements and the ability to provide additional personnel were addressed. It indicated it has access to a pool of experienced casual cleaning staff able to support its team as required.	It has extensive experience providing cleaning services to aquatic and leisure centres across Australia. Examples included Venue West's HBF Stadium (17,000m²) and HBF Arena (20,000m²) - for period from 2010 to 2025. Other examples were YMCA's South Australia Aquatic and Leisure Centre (14,000m² from 2011 to 2021) and Sydney Olympic Park Aquatic Centre (14,000m²). These include very similar facilities and services to the City's requirements however, examples did not involve local government clients.	It demonstrated a sound understanding of the required tasks. It proposed cleaning methodology including a review on current conditions at Craigie Leisure Centre and potential amendments to schedule of works. It provided examples on cleaning for certain surfaces and the actions it took on challenges. It also addressed male/female staff allocation, uniforms and ID, use of software, rosters and site security such as keys and access.	Its head office is based in Tullamarine, VIC and its WA office is located in Ascot. It stated the company commits to sourcing all cleaning equipment, consumables and chemicals associated with this contract from businesses based within the City. It currently has over 40 staff members residing in the City.	72.9%	\$1,772,098 203 (total no. hours per week)	1

			Comment Agains	t Criteria			Fadanatal	
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience in providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
Facilities First Australia Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It was established in 1994. It currently has over 350 employees, servicing the wider Perth and Peel regions. An organisational chart for its WA office and details of nominated key WA staff including their years of industry experience were provided. A list of specialised equipment that will be used was supplied with photographs taken of actual products and machines at its stores. Though it did not fully address or provide afterhours contact numbers for emergency requirements or the ability to provide additional personnel, it listed some of its major current commitments, demonstrating its capacity to resource work and current workload.	It has extensive experience providing similar services to local governments including the Cities of Melville (full public leisure facilities at both the Melville and Booragoon Leisureplex – from 2017 to current) and Cockburn (ARC offices and leisure centre areas tenanted locations and public facilities – 2017 to current). It is the City's incumbent supplier.	It demonstrated a thorough understanding and appreciation of the City's requirements. It submitted a comprehensive response. It proposed cleaning methodology and approach including the development of a new transition plan, complete start-up clean, client service manager weekly meetings and IT system to track work. Examples of cleaning different surfaces including a milestone schedule in the form of a Gantt chart were provided.	It has offices in all states and territories in Australia. Its WA branch is located in Kardinya. It stated the company will work closely with its WA Perth based recruitment team, in ensuring its employees are being recruited from within the City wherever possible.	71.5%	\$1,545,610 206.21(total no. hours per week)	2

			Comment Agains	st Criteria				
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience in providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
Office Cleaning Experts Pty Ltd (OCE Corporate Cleaning) All requirements have been met.	Yes	It was established in 1991. It currently has more than 200 personnel. An organisational chart and details of key personnel including their roles and experience were provided. Details of the specialised equipment, with the exception of radios, specified for use in carrying out the services were provided. It operates a 24/7 number and has a contingency plan in place. It stated the company has relief cleaners on standby to attend to emergency requirements.	It demonstrated experience providing cleaning services to local governments in WA. Examples included the Cities of Mandurah (Aquatic and Recreation Centre – 6,000m², held for six years ongoing), Rockingham (AquaJetty in Warnbro – three years) and Wanneroo (Aquamotion – 2,350m², 8 years commenced 2010). Only one of these is current contract.	It demonstrated an understanding of the required tasks. It proposed the use of WhatsApp for reporting issues and on-site communication. It provided a general response, covering briefly on cleaners safety training requirements and on how it will supply the service. A timeline was supplied with an outline of tasks to be carried out, prior to and one week after works commencing. However, it did not include the proposed cleaning methodology on how it will carry out the required tasks.	It is based in Wangara and has an office located in Ocean Reef. It operates an office located in Ocean Reef. It indicated the company utilises local suppliers for chemical supplies. Its directors and all administrative personnel reside in the City.	64.5%	\$1,571,738 221 (total no. hours per week)	3

			Comment Agains	t Criteria			Fatimata d	
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience in providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
BrightMark Group Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It was established 20 years ago and incorporated in 2017. It currently has 180 staff (including 11 management, 44 full-time, 85 part-time and 40 casual employees). Its structure of business and details of key personnel including their qualifications, industry experience and roles in the contract were provided. A detailed list of specialised equipment with make, model, age and maintenance plan were supplied. It operates an emergency 1300 number available 24/7 and its supervisor is also available 24/7. It indicated the company has a contingency plan in place and the ability to provide additional personnel.	It demonstrated experience providing cleaning services to various local governments in WA. Numerous examples of works were provided and these included the Cities of Subiaco (Lord Recreation Centre – 2018 to 2021), Gosnells (Mills Park Recreation Centre - 2004 ongoing) and Melville (across 45 sites including sport club rooms, change rooms and public amenities – 2018 to 2020 with option of two years plus two terms) and the Shire of Augusta – Margaret River (various assets – 2018 to 2023). Only two of these involved aquatic facilities and on a smaller scale to the facilities at Craigie Leisure Centre.	It demonstrated a sound understanding of the required tasks. It submitted a detailed response with proposed cleaning methodologies for all areas of cleans. It also noted the five key pillars or components, of which it based its approach to manage any scale contract and this comprised (1) qualified management team, (2) relevant experience, (3) contract management tool - training, supervision and reporting, (4) planning and implementation and (5) advanced technology.	It is located in Claremont. It currently has six staff members residing in the City.	63.4%	\$1,003,316 208 (total no. hours per week)	4

			Comment Agains	t Criteria			Fatimata d	
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience in providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
ISG Cleaning Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It commenced operation in 2008. It has a workforce of over 200 people including 37 full-time employees. An organisational chart and details of key personnel including their qualifications, length of service and industry experience were provided. It listed the equipment required to provide the services though information on equipment age or condition was not supplied. Its submission included afterhours contacts for emergency requirements. It indicated the company has the ability to provide additional personnel as it has a large pool of trained and multi-skilled workforce to draw upon.	It demonstrated experience providing cleaning services to various organisations in WA. Examples included Venus West (HBF Stadium - arena/aquatic facilities - 42,109m² and HBF Arena – arena / grandstand/ changerooms/ football facilities - 155,000m² - contract period for both venues - from 2011 to present), Edith Cowan and Murdoch Universities (campus and accommodation - break out rooms, gym and toilets - 10,000m² at each campus, contract period for both universities - 2012 to present). These did not include local government clients and only one involved aquatic facilities.	It demonstrated an understanding of the required tasks. It proposed to implement a mobilisation plan that details all activities required for the transition of contract commencement. It stated that if appointed, it would develop a contract management plan and communications plan. It made reference to the use of two-way radios, email communications and communications book. However, an actual cleaning methodology on how the cleaning tasks will be carried out was not provided.	It is located in Bayswater. It indicated the company, if successful, will purchase supplies and materials from local suppliers within the City. Its proposed team for this contract will largely reside in the City. It has previously and currently supported local community activities in Joondalup and some of these include, local church product and service donations, event sponsorship, charity work and WAFL Club support.	59.5%	\$1,640,548 189 (total no. hours per week)	5

			Comment Agains	t Criteria			Estimated	
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience in providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Total Comparative Price	Rank
The Trustee for Bellrock Cleaning Services Trust All requirements have been met.	Yes	It has been providing cleaning services in WA since 2010. It currently has over 50 cleaners. It has a national office based in Keilor Park, VIC. An organisation structure and details of key personnel including their roles and industry experience were provided. It listed a small range of equipment. However it did not include the equipment specified for use in providing the services to the City. Though key contacts and 24 hour call centre number were submitted, the ability to provide additional personnel was not addressed.	It demonstrated experience providing cleaning services to various buildings and facilities for local governments in WA including the Cities of Fremantle (contract period – 2018 to 2020), Gosnells (2017 to current), Swan (2017 to current), Swan (2017 to current), South Perth (2013 to current) and Joondalup (2015 to current). Insufficient information was submitted on the scope of work, outcomes and similarity to this requirement.	It demonstrated a good understanding of the required tasks. Though a basic cleaning methodology was supplied, it outlined the various tasks to be carried out, from general cleaning including floor, glass and partitions to ablution and BBQ cleaning.	Its WA office is located in Malaga. It indicated, where possible, all its operational staff will be based in the City for this Contract. Its general manager has resided in the City since 2000.	51.6%	\$871,750 101.5 (total no. hours per week)	6

			Comment Agains	t Criteria			Fatimatad	
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience in providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
CSCH Pty Ltd (Charles Service Company) All requirements have been met.	Yes	It has been providing commercial cleaning services in WA for over 55 years. It has a pool of more than 350 permanent part time employees. An organisational structure and details of three key personnel including their roles and years of experience were provided. It stated the company owns a very large inventory of the proposed equipment and that all is less than four years old. It operates a 24/7 mobile emergency response team unit dedicated to respond to additional or out of scope works on an as needs and/or emergency basis. Also, it has a reserve team to cover unforeseen changes.	It has extensive experience providing commercial cleaning services to various organisations in WA including local governments. Five examples of works were provided and these were for cleaning of various buildings and facilities for the Cities of Kwinana (20,000m², from 2006 to current), Nedlands (2007 to 2014 and 2018 to current), Fremantle (15,000m², 2006 to 2018 and 2020 to current) and Joondalup (20,000m², 2009 to 2015) and Presbyterian Ladies College (30,000m², 1970 to current). However, only two of these services involved leisure centres cleaning for the Cities of Kwinana and Fremantle.	It submitted a brief response demonstrating its understanding of the City's requirements. It proposed a team of eight permanent part time male and female staff members, including a team leader, to provide the services. Emergency response timeframes were suppled. However, its submission did not include the proposed methodology or approach in carrying out the required tasks.	It is located in West Perth. It stated the company always aims to employ people living close to site.	49.5%	\$1,553,636 183 (total no. hours per week)	7

			Comment Agains	t Criteria			Estimated	
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience in providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Total Comparative Price	Rank
Smart Cleaning Solutions (VIC) Pty Ltd All requirements have not been met - it did not indicate its agreement to comply with the conditions included in the RFT or warrants unconditional compliance with the Specification.	Partially	It has been providing cleaning services since 2009. It currently employs approximately 1,800 staff across Australia. It commenced operation in WA six years ago. It employs over 300 cleaners across metropolitan and regional WA. An organisational chart and details of two key personnel including their roles and experience were provided. It listed some equipment though it did not include the specialised equipment specified for use to carry out the services. It indicated the company has access to a 24/7 customer service centre and help desk for emergency and response cleaning. It has a contingency plan in place to provide short or long term staff relief.	It did not fully demonstrate experience providing similar cleaning services. It submitted three case studies and these included core and periodical cleaning services currently undertaken for YMCA (482 sites nationally), Think Childcare and Early Learning Centres (285 childcare centres and early learning schools, nationally and to 11 childcare centres across regional and metropolitan WA) and ALH Group (128 gaming/entertainment venues - nationally). However, limited information was submitted on scope of work, outcomes and similarity to this requirement. Examples did not include local government clients and only one involved leisure centres, which were YMCA's.	It demonstrated an understanding of the required tasks. It proposed transition-in, labour and recruitment plans. It stated the company will develop and provide tailored operational reporting (daily, weekly and monthly). However, its submission did not include the proposed cleaning methodology or approach on how the cleaning tasks will be carried out. It indicated the company will carry out formal monthly meeting and 100 day reviews. The panel noted weekly cleaning reviews are being carried out at the Centre.	Its head office is based in Mount Waverly, VIC. Its Perth office is located at St Georges Terrace. It stated the company's preference is to utilise local suppliers for all contracts.	45.1%	\$1,173,264 173.6 (total no. hours per week)	8

			Comment Agains	t Criteria			Fatimated	
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience in providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
Storm International Pty Limited All requirements have been met.	Yes	It was founded in 1991. It currently employs more than 500 staff nationally. An organisational structure and details of key personnel including their qualifications, experience and involvement on similar projects were provided. Though it merely listed the equipment specified for use in this contract, it stated the company's practice is to, on award of a new contract, purchase new plant and equipment for servicing of the contract. It indicated its service team is on call 24/7 and the company has standby teams with fully equipped vehicles to attend to emergency requirements.	It did not fully demonstrate experience providing similar services. Examples were provided and these were for cleaning services at various buildings or sites for the Cities of Greater Geelong (28 sites ranging between 800m² and 10,000m², from 2012 to 2022), Ryde (ranging between 150m² and 550m², 2005 to 2020), Salisbury (16 sites ranging between 500m² and 1,500m², 2014 to 2021) and Hawkesbury (ranging between 1,000m² – 8,000m², 2005 to 2021). All of these were for regular and periodic cleaning services. However, none involved leisure centres or WA local government clients. Only one example of works, which was for the City of Hawkesbury, included sports facilities.	It did not fully demonstrate its understanding of the City's requirements. Its submission included a transition plan / program in the form of a Gantt chart. However, it merely reiterated the list of tasks and areas of works listed in the specification. The proposed cleaning methodology to carry out the specific tasks was not provided.	Its head office is located in Yennora, NSW. It has 15 cleaning staff members that are based in the City.	42.3%	\$989,857 189 (total no. hours per week)	9

			Comment Agains	t Criteria			Catimata d	
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience in providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
The Trustee for Panich Family Trust trading as DMC Cleaning All requirements have not been met - though indicated yes to critical assumptions, did not provide details or specify critical assumptions made.	Partially	It was established in 1996. It currently has six full-time and 49 part-time staff. An organisational chart and details of key personnel including their roles and experience were provided. A list of equipment and machinery, fleet and products to service the contract was supplied, however, it did not include all of the specialised equipment specified for use to complete the services. After hours contacts for emergency requirements were supplied. It indicated the company has access to an extensive employee database if additional personnel are required to provide support.	It did not fully demonstrate experience providing similar services. Numerous examples of works were provided and these included cleaning services for the Shires of Boddington (area size 10,000m², contract period from 2015 to 2020), Merredin (9,000m², 2016 to 2022), Brookton (8,000m², 2018 to 2020) and Northam (9,000m², 2017 to 2022). However, these were mainly for building cleaning provided in regional WA and services involved no leisure or aquatic facilities.	It demonstrated some understanding of the City's requirements. Though its submission included the proposed approach in carrying out the services, general information was submitted on contract performance and on-site management.	It indicated in Kalamunda. It indicated it supports buy local and employ local policies by obtaining goods and services as near to the contract sites.	39.8%	\$1,202,648 217 (total no. hours per week)	.10

			Comment Agains	t Criteria			Fatimatad	
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience in providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
OCS Services Pty Ltd All requirements have not been met - proposed amendments to the conditions of contract, in particular, price basis and variations, to incorporate a full rise and fall provision.	Partially	It was established in 1900. It is a multi-national company operating in 12 countries with 86,000 personnel. It currently employs 700 staff in Australia. An organisational chart and details of key personnel (mainly management team) including their roles, experience, relevant skills and qualifications were provided. It listed a small range of equipment, with most on the list of specialised equipment specified for use to provide the services. It indicated its dedicated customer services manager to the City will be available 24/7 on-call and the company has the ability to provide additional personnel.	It did not fully demonstrate experience providing similar services. Examples included commercial cleaning for the Department of Local Government, Sport and Cultural Industries (offices, toilets, change rooms, meeting rooms, gym, sports equipment, carpark, windows - 12 years duration) and Dumas House (general cleaning, ad hoc and emergency cleaning and periodic cleaning, 2011 to present). Other examples were for consolidated services currently undertaken for the Perth Children's Court (from 2014), Central Law Courts (from 2004), Dumas House (from 2011) and WA Parliament House (from 2013). However, all these involved no local government clients or leisure centres with wet/dry facilities.	It demonstrated its understanding of the required tasks. It indicated the company will utilise a sub-contractor (Satyam Facility Services Pty Ltd) to service this contract under its sub-contractor model. Details of the proposed plan for sub-contractor management, sub-contractor performance management and annual reviews were provided. However, the panel noted insufficient information was submitted on the proposed sub-contractor and cleaning methodology.	Its Perth office is located in Belmont. It stated the company currently has employed staff under its other contracts and in its management office from the City.	38.5%	\$1,059,074 168 (total no. hours per week)	11

			Comment Agains	t Criteria			Fatimatad	
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience in providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
Iconic Property Services Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It commenced operation in 2014. It currently has over 500 direct employees. An organisational chart and details of key personnel including their roles and responsibilities were provided. However, limited information was submitted on experience of some key staff. A small range of equipment was supplied though it included only some of the specialised equipment specified for use to provide the services. It stated its dedicated account manager and senior management staff are available 24/7 to respond to emergencies and additional requests. Also, it has access to labour hire companies to implement a contingency plan for relief staff.	It did not fully demonstrate experience providing similar services. Four examples of works were provided and these were for cleaning services to various facilities for the Town of Victoria Park (periodic cleaning at Aqualife), the Cities of Wanneroo (Aquamotion and Kingsway indoor stadium), Perth (public amenities) and Vincent (Beatty Park). However, limited information was submitted on the scope of work, outcomes and similarity to the City's requirement. Also, period and dates of contracts or when these works were carried out were not supplied.	It demonstrated some understanding of the City's requirements. It submitted a brief outline of the process for service delivery and a roster with proposed monthly and periodicals cleans. However, its submission did not include the proposed methodology or approach on how the specific tasks at the leisure centre facilities will be carried out.	It is located in Mt Lawley. It did not submit a response.	37.4%	\$1,213,909 164.5 (total no. hours per week)	12

		Comment Against Criteria					Fatimatad	
Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Capacity	Demonstrated experience in providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
M Baric & R.J Sczesny (Green Tree Cleaning Solutions) All requirements have been met.	Yes	It commenced service in 2019. It currently has approximately 72 employees. Its structure of business and details of key personnel including their roles and industry experience were provided. A list of equipment was supplied though it did not include any the specialised equipment specified for use to provide the services. It stated it has supervisory staff and management available on a 24 hour call basis and relief staff will be brought on sites as needed. However, contact details or a specific number to contact for emergency requirements were not provided.	It submitted a brief response demonstrating experience providing cleaning services to various organisations in WA. Examples included St Stephens Schools (at Duncraig site 26,800m² and Carramar site 23,500m² – contract period from 2016 to present), Murdoch Campus (25,700m² - 1999 to 2018) and Challenger TAFE (Beaconsfield 24,000m² – 2000 to 2018). However, these were all education facilities and though some sites have gyms, none of these involved leisure centres or aquatic facilities.	It did not submit sufficient information demonstrating its understanding of the required tasks. A contract start up plan with reference to safety, staff training, communications including proposed monthly inspection reports, cleaners signin and sign-off were provided. However, it did not include the proposed methodology or approach on how the cleaning tasks specific to the leisure centre facilities will be carried out.	It is located in East Perth. It stated it supports local businesses on an ongoing basis through the purchase of materials, cleaning equipment, consumables and other operational requirements from local suppliers. It has staff members residing in the City.	29.8%	\$879,897 168 (total no. hours per week)	13

	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria					Fatimated	
Tenderer & Description of Response		Capacity	Demonstrated experience in providing similar services	Demonstrated understanding of the required tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community	Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
RNM Cleaning Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	It has been providing cleaning services for over three years. It currently has 10 to 15 employees. An organisational chart and details of four key personnel including their roles and experience were provided. It listed the specialised equipment specified for use to provide the services and stated the company will be using this equipment on the City's site to complete the cleaning requirements. However, it did not indicate whether the company has this equipment or it needs to be purchased. Its submission included emergency contact numbers. It stated the company has a pooling system whereby it can provide additional cleaners upon request.	It has been providing commercial cleaning services for The Rural Health West Building and the AMA Buildings (area size 1,429m² and 1,850m², respectively, from 2018 to current). One other example of works was for periodical cleaning services for Southern Cross Austereo (3,000m² – 2017 to current). These services involved multi-story office cleaning with no leisure or aquatic facilities or similar size centre to the City's requirement.	It submitted insufficient information demonstrating its understanding of the City's requirements. Though a basic roster for staff and schedule of duties which the company utilises for other premises including work order process and training policy were supplied, the proposed methodology or approach in carrying out the required tasks was not provided. It proposed a 90 day review process, though weekly cleaning reviews are currently being carried out at the leisure centre facilities.	It is located in Banksia Grove. It indicated the company will endeavour to source most of the products and equipment from the local Bunnings store and Godfreys Joondalup for servicing this contract.	28.6%	\$2,275,441 258.47 (total no. hours per week)	14