

SUMMARY OF REQUEST FOR TENDER SUBMISSIONS

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Fixed Lump Sum	Rank
		Demonstrated Experience Completing Leisure Centre Construction Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>Pindan Projects (WA) Pty Ltd</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	<p>The company demonstrated considerable experience in completing sports, aquatic and recreation facilities with specific examples cited as follows: Mundaring Sports Stadium for the Shire of Mundaring in 2018 (\$8m), the Pearsall Hocking Community Centre for the City of Wanneroo in 2016 (\$3.85m), the Eaton Sports Pavilions for the Shire of Dardanup in 2017 (\$5.6m), the Kalamunda Community Centre for the City of Kalamunda in 2021 (\$4.88m), the Corpus Christi College Aquatic Centre for Corpus Christi College in 2021 (\$4.87m), the Maylands Multipurpose Centre for the City of Bayswater in 2011 (\$21m), Karratha Leisureplex for the City of Karratha in 2014 (\$52.9m) and the Onslow Aquatic and Recreation Centre for the Shire of Ashburton in 2017 (\$6.5m). Elements of these projects comprised the construction of in-door sports courts, childcare facilities, indoor sports halls, gyms, cafes, exercise weights areas, reception areas and large car parks which were considered comparable to the City's requirements.</p>	<p>The company demonstrated a reasonable understanding of the required tasks. Its construction management and methodology plan identified key aspects of the project which was accompanied by a site establishment plan. Explanations were provided for how the groundworks, roof and façade will be undertaken and how it will conduct quality control, defects management, testing, commissioning, and handover. Key risks and mitigation strategies had been identified. It has robust systems in place accredited to ISO 9001,14001 and AS/NZS 4801 for quality, environment and occupational health and safety management systems respectively and provided information required for its environmental management. Basic information was provided for chemical usage. Capability statements were sighted for 30 sub-contractors with previous experience and financial capability lacking for some. Despite the project program depicting an incorrect commencement date, all other timelines accord with the City's expectations.</p>	<p>The company has been in operation since 1977. It employs 350 staff and provided its organisation structure supported by details for the proposed team and resumes for seven key personnel with appropriate qualifications and industry experience. The commitment schedule did not correlate to the proposed project team's workload or availability however it was noted that two of the seven projects will be completed by July 2021. Two employees were nominated as contingency staff and details of proposed plant and equipment including daily usage was sighted. Emergency contact information was omitted.</p>	<p>The company is based in Perth and has two regional South West offices in Busselton and Albany.</p> <p>It will encourage sub-contractors to support the local community by purchasing locally and will endeavour to employ local employees to perform the work.</p>	65.5%	\$8,820,432	1

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Fixed Lump Sum	Rank
		Demonstrated Experience Completing Leisure Centre Construction Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
BE Projects (WA) Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	The company demonstrated very good experience in completing projects with elements comparable to the City's contract and provided full project details comprising new buildings and renovations for eight projects to demonstrate size and complexity of the works. Specific projects noted as being comparable to the City's contract were the Lakelands Shared Sports Facility for the City of Mandurah in 2020 (\$2.7m), the Kalamunda Districts Hockey Club for the City of Kalamunda in 2018 (\$1.69m), Canning Vale College Alterations / Additions for the Department of Finance Building Management and Works in 2019 (\$2.039m), the current Cockburn Wetlands Precinct for the City of Cockburn (\$5m) and the Golden Bay Sporting Pavilion / renovation of the Singleton Sports and Community Centre for the City of Rockingham in 2017 (\$8.8m). The scope of works for these projects included conducting works concurrently across multiple sites, staged handovers, constructing change rooms, toilets, function rooms, store rooms, specialist courts and halls plus extensive civil and hard landscaping.	The company demonstrated a very good understanding of the required tasks. The company intends to complete the car park works in the shortest time period possible and will work with its sub-contracted traffic management company to customise a traffic management plan providing temporary access over the works. It identified equipment that will have notable lead times and detailed how it will manage the precast panels installation. It provided a construction management plan highlighting actions that will be undertaken and a table of risk areas, their controls, and the person responsible. An environmental and waste management plan included environmental aspects, impacts and risks. The schedule of chemicals to be utilised during the project was submitted accompanied by associated material safety data sheets. Details for sub-contractors were sighted with previous project experience noted for most. Personnel commitments and financial capacity were not acknowledged for all companies. The provisional construction program showed milestones which accord to the City's requirements.	The company was established in 2010 and submitted details of eleven personnel. The number of full-time employees was not specifically stated. Personnel appointed to the project team are sufficiently qualified and experienced to perform their respective roles. The ability to provide additional personnel / resources was not initially adequately addressed. An extensive list of major constructional plant and specialised equipment was sighted with most being hired. A list of current commitments and capacity was noted. Emergency contact information was provided.	The company has two depots in Subiaco and Boddington. It employs one person who resides in the City of Joondalup and its nominated plumbing sub-contractor is located in Greenwood.	60.4%	\$7,166,489	2

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Fixed Lump Sum	Rank
		Demonstrated Experience Completing Leisure Centre Construction Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Tardan Pty Ltd (Western Projects) All requirements have been met.	Yes	Western Projects demonstrated reasonable experience in completing leisure centre construction projects. It cited four projects being the Queens Park Sporting Complex, the UWA Human Movement Pool Refurbishment, the Curtin University Stadium Upgrades and the UWA Recreation Centre Upgrades but did not include specific details such as contract value, refurbishment dates, size, and complexity, for the Evaluation Panel to ascertain similarities to the City's contract and the ability to undertake leisure centre construction projects. Project profiles were noted for the Botanic Gardens and Parks Authority (BGPA) Kings Park Wanju Marr Facility (\$1.8m), Curtin University East Gate Toilets and Hayman Theatre Upgrade (\$3m), UWA Reid Library refurbishment (\$6.5m), and BGPA Kings Park and Botanic Garden Volunteer Hub. Aspects such as working with precast concrete tilt panel construction, environmental management, and refurbishment in public open spaces were noted.	The company demonstrated a reasonable understanding of the required tasks submitting a generic bulleted list covering keys aspects of the project. A site management plan for both stages was sighted. The methodology did not specifically link to the program with discrepancies noted within its critical assumptions with respect to working hours. It submitted construction program stated 26 weeks for Stage 1 and 32 weeks for Stage 2 which does not align with the time clauses in the City's specification being 20 and 40 weeks respectively, however the overall schedule meets the City's specified 60 weeks. A high level environmental management plan was noted which included an environmental policy and a site environmental checklist. A sample project risk register was sighted which identified environmental risks which were all grouped under one category. A list of chemicals was provided accompanied by material safety data sheets. Statements were provided for its nine nominated sub-contractors with financials and project / personnel commitments not noted for all. Information for companies providing carpentry and concrete services was lacking	The company was established in 1988. An overview was provided for the four key staff members, illustrating industry experience, plus relevant qualifications. The Site Manager's exposure to working on large complex leisure centre refurbishments was limited having predominantly worked on small addition / alteration projects of less than \$950k. A list of four current commitments was submitted comprising smaller redevelopment / refurbishment projects one of which is 65% complete. After hours information was not adequately addressed and the ability to provide additional personnel and resources was omitted. A generic list of plant to be used on the contract was sighted.	The company is located in Balcatta and stated that several employees are City of Joondalup residents. It will use the services of a brickwork company who is located within the City's boundaries.	52.9%	\$6,881,888	3

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Fixed Lump Sum	Rank
		Demonstrated Experience Completing Leisure Centre Construction Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Capacity	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>Renascent Western Australia Pty Ltd</p> <p>All requirements have been met.</p>	Yes	<p>The company did not demonstrate sufficient experience in completing leisure centre construction projects. It provided nine examples of projects whereby it had undertaken demolition and refurbishment of facilities being Victory Life Church (\$2.8m), ECU library (\$975k), 81 and 109 St Georges Terrace (\$1.1m and \$1.7m), Gymnea North Primary School (\$1.9m), HBF Stadium (\$170k), TechnipFMC Office Fit out William Street (\$8.3m), Technical Court Services Hay Street (\$8.5m) and OAMS Health and Wellbeing Centre (\$1.2m). Most of these contracts were for office type refurbishments or office fit outs with three projects noted as having some elements comparable to the City's project (Gymnea North Primary School, HBF Stadium and OAMS Health and Wellbeing Centre). A brief project overview was provided for each contract including the architect, floor area and delivery method.</p>	<p>The company demonstrated a general understanding of the required tasks. The methodology was not tailored to the City's specifications providing no clear indication of what would be performed under each stage of the works and how the works would be transitioned through the stages. A list of critical assumptions was provided with some exclusions contradicting the specification. A very brief summary of environmental monitoring and health surveillance was included in the draft project management plan. A project risk register referred to some environmental incidents. Chemical information was submitted supported by associated material safety data sheets. The company is accredited to ISO 9001, 14001 and AS/NZS 4801 for quality, environment and occupational health and safety management systems respectively. 23 sub-contractors were nominated however no detail was provided for their experience. The project program indicated a start date which does not accord with the City's requirements.</p>	<p>The company was founded in 1996 and employs 140 staff nationally. Whilst the number of full-time employees was not specifically stated for Perth, its organisation structure depicted four positions who are available to attend site. Resumes were noted for key personnel with project experience gained predominantly in retail/office/school extensions, refurbishments, and fit outs. The company's commitments showed five contracts underway all will be completed by July 2021. It is able to arrange back up resources due to having a large national support structure but did not clarify how this would be implemented.</p>	<p>The company operates in Sydney, Melbourne, Orange, Brisbane, Canberra and Perth. It has team members who are residents in the City of Joondalup and will engage plumbing and brick sub-contractors who are located in the City's boundaries.</p>	46.1%	\$7,366,257	4