

TENDER 001/21 PROVISION OF WORKS TO REMOVE AND DISPOSE OF GRASS THATCH

SCHEDULE OF ITEMS

Item	Description	Unit of Measure
1	Removal of thatch / grass debris from the park by compactor truck and bobcat (including travelling costs).	Per tonne
2	Compactor truck disposal of thatch / grass debris by the Contractor.	Per tonne

TENDER 001/21 PROVISION OF WORKS TO REMOVE AND DISPOSE OF GRASS THATCH

SUMMARY OF REQUEST FOR TENDER SUBMISSIONS

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Contract Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Services	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
West Tip Waste Control Pty Ltd as trustee for the Stefna Family Trust trading as West Tip Waste Control Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Yes	The company has been operating for over 30 years, employs over 60 people, and operates a fleet of 50 trucks and 14 pieces of mobile plant. It submitted two organisation charts showing its corporate structure and key personnel relevant to the City's contract. Proposed supervisory staff have between five and 25 years' experience and have appropriate qualifications and experience in managing / facilitating verge collection services, green and bulk hard waste, and collecting thatch from parks. Registrations / licences were sighted for equipment operators. It has a dedicated vehicle washdown bay and workshop at its facilities. Further plant has been allocated in the event of equipment failure and the ability to provide additional resources was addressed. It is accredited to ISO 9001:2015 Quality Management Systems.	The company demonstrated substantial experience in providing similar services. It has been undertaking thatch collection and disposal services for the City since 2017 (\$130k), performing two, six-week simultaneous hard waste and green waste collections per annum for City of Nedlands since 2019 (\$650k), and hard waste and green waste collections with verge side segregation of recyclables for the City of Armadale over 39 weeks per annum since 2019 (\$3m). Additional verge collections were noted for Town of Cottesloe and City of Subiaco between 2017-2020.	The company demonstrated a sound understanding of the required tasks. It will provide two to five operators including an on-site operations manager to manage physical delivery of collection services, assisted by customer service and logistics officers. The nominated five rear loading 28m ³ compactor vehicles were considered of sufficient capacity to remove the City's required volumes of thatch on each visit, and due to the skid steers with grab buckets being fitted with low impact turf tyres, the plant was deemed suitable to undertake the works. Relevant safety aspects were addressed.	The company is based in Malaga. The company employs seven staff who live within the City of Joondalup.	83.4%	\$240,677	1

TENDER 001/21 PROVISION OF WORKS TO REMOVE AND DISPOSE OF GRASS THATCH

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Contract Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Services	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>Alvito Pty Ltd as trustee for the Tony Stampalia Trust trading as Incredible Bulk</p> <hr/> <p>All requirements have not been met. The company did not submit a quality assurance certification or formal internal quality control system procedures. Evidence to support relevant qualifications and / or licences were not sighted.</p>	Partially Compliant	<p>The company was incorporated as Stampalia Contractors in 1977 with the entity Incredible Bulk commencing in 2005. It has been involved in bulk refuse collections for over 25 years. Whilst the company submitted an organisation structure showing key positions comprising the managing director, administration manager, workshop and bulk refuse supervisors, and equipment operators, the number of full-time staff was omitted. Details for personnel who would be allocated to the City's contract including their licences / qualifications and length of industry experience were lacking. It has access to four skid steer loaders with slick tyres and bucket attachments and five 19m³ compactor trucks and has a fully equipped workshop capable of handling maintenance issues. The ability to provide additional personnel and mobilise based upon timelines were not addressed.</p>	<p>The company did not demonstrate any experience in providing similar services. Scopes of work, outcomes, and similarities to the City's requirements including details of contracts held were omitted. References were provided for three local governments one of which was the City.</p>	<p>The company did not demonstrate an understanding of the required tasks with the Evaluation Panel failing to sight any information within the submission to evidence the company's proposed methodology and approach.</p>	<p>The company did not specifically state its principal location. One director resides within the City of Joondalup.</p>	17%	\$231,978	2

TENDER 001/21 PROVISION OF WORKS TO REMOVE AND DISPOSE OF GRASS THATCH

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Contract Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Services	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
FTF Transport Pty Ltd (Alternative Offer) All requirements have not been met.	No	The company was assessed as non-compliant. It did not comply with the City's specification, offering plant and equipment that was deemed unsuitable to conduct the works. The proposed solution, using a 6-wheeler truck with pig combination, semi-trucks, and bobcats, is not practicable and has the potential to cause significant damage to the City's parks. It has insufficient insurance coverage and did not provide an accompanying conforming offer as required under the City's tender clause 4.8.				Not assessed for qualitative criteria or price.	\$347,967	N/A