

TENDER 010/21 BUILDING MINOR WORKS AND MAINTENANCE OF VALUE LESS THAN \$250,000

SCHEDULE OF ITEMS

SCHEDULE OF HOURLY RATES OFFERED (ITEMS 1-9)

Item	Description
1.0 Qualified Carpenter	
1.1	Normal working hours 7.00am to 3.30pm
1.2	After hours 3.30pm to 7.00am
1.3	After hours emergency standby
1.4	After hours call out maximum including the first 3 hours labour
1.5	Saturday
1.6	Sunday and Public Holiday
2.0 Qualified Bricklayer	
2.1	Normal working hours 7.00am to 3.30pm
2.2	After hours 3.30pm to 7.00am
2.3	Saturday
2.4	Sunday and Public Holiday
3.0 Qualified Painter	
3.1	Normal working hours 7.00am to 3.30pm
3.2	After hours 3.30pm to 7.00am
3.3	Saturday
3.4	Sunday and Public Holiday
4.0 Apprentice First Year	
4.1	Normal working hours 7.00am to 3.30pm
4.2	After hours 3.30pm to 7.00am
4.3	Saturday
4.4	Sunday and Public Holiday
5.0 Apprentice Second Year	
5.1	Normal working hours 7.00am to 3.30pm
5.2	After hours 3.30pm to 7.00am
5.3	Saturday
5.4	Sunday and Public Holiday
6.0 Apprentice Third Year	
6.1	Normal working hours 7.00am to 3.30pm
6.2	After hours 3.30pm to 7.00am

TENDER 010/21 BUILDING MINOR WORKS AND MAINTENANCE OF VALUE LESS THAN \$250,000

Item	Description
6.3	Saturday
6.4	Sunday and Public Holiday
7.0 Apprentice Fourth Year	
7.1	Normal working hours 7.00am to 3.30pm
7.2	After hours 3.30pm to 7.00am
7.3	Saturday
7.4	Sunday and Public Holiday
8.0 General Labourer	
8.1	Normal working hours 7.00am to 3.30pm
8.2	After hours 3.30pm to 7.00am
8.3	Saturday
8.4	Sunday and Public Holiday
9.0 Other Rates	
9.1	Site Supervisor
9.2	Construction Manager
9.3	Project Manager
9.4	Construction Estimator
9.5	Managing Director
9.6	Project Administration
9.7	Budget/Feasibility Reporting
9.8	Onsite Meeting/Reporting

PERCENTAGE MARK-UP - MATERIALS AND PLANT HIRE (ITEM 10)

Item	Description
10.1	Materials percentage mark-up applicable to works undertaken using items 1 - 36
10.2	Plant hire percentage mark-up inclusive of supervision

PERCENTAGE MARK UP - SUB-CONTRACTOR NEW WORKS (ITEM 11)

Item	Value of Works
11.1	\$0 to \$10,000
11.2	\$10,001 to \$50,000
11.3	\$50,001 to \$250,000

TENDER 010/21 BUILDING MINOR WORKS AND MAINTENANCE OF VALUE LESS THAN \$250,000

PERCENTAGE MARK UP - SUB-CONTRACTOR RENOVATION WORKS (ITEM 12)

Item	Value of Works
12.1	\$0 to \$10,000
12.2	\$10,001 to \$50,000
12.2	\$50,001 to \$250,000

SUMMARY OF REQUEST FOR TENDER SUBMISSIONS

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Hickey Constructions Pty Ltd All requirements have been met.	Compliant	The company has been operating since 2014 and has six full-time employees. It submitted its business structure supported by resumes for its key personnel highlighting appropriate trade qualifications and industry experience to undertake components of the City's scope of works including, but not limited to, building, carpentry and bricklaying. Its nominated sub-contractors will provide services for painting, roofing, steelwork, flooring and plastering. National police certifications and asbestos removal licences were sighted. The company submitted a comprehensive list of plant and equipment including the proposed use, quantities available and photographs. An in-house mechanic services most of the equipment. It can source additional resources from the relationships it has with carpentry / labour hire companies and provided emergency contact information for four persons.	Hickey Constructions Pty Ltd submitted a list of 120 completed projects (81 for the Cities of Joondalup, Bayswater, Wanneroo and Belmont) including value and duration to demonstrate its extensive experience in conducting minor works similar to the City's requirements. A total of 16 projects supervised by the construction manager nominated for the City's scope of works were sighted to demonstrate similar experience in works conducted for libraries, public toilet refurbishments, office extensions and additions to leisure facilities. Director's experience on past projects for previous employers was also noted. In addition to the minor works projects it has contracts for ongoing maintenance and emergency call out for the Cities of Bayswater (six years), Wanneroo (six years), and Belmont (four years). It is the incumbent supplier of building minor works and maintenance to the City.	The company demonstrated a thorough understanding of the required tasks. It provided the key tasks to be performed separating these into building minor works and maintenance works. Key risks associated with the works were identified and strategies provided for how these will be mitigated and managed. It acknowledged that the City has nominated sub-contractors for plumbing and electrical components of the works and how these relationships will be handled. Arrangements for cost control and handover of projects were highlighted. Key processes, responsibilities of the parties, and approximate timelines were noted for maintenance works however there was no inclusion of emergency call out timeframes. Comprehensive process charts were included to explain how the business operates its quoting, construction, maintenance, handover, and invoicing activities.	The company is based in Yanchep. It has nominated a sub-contractor who is located within the City of Joondalup and will use numerous suppliers for paint, tools, bricks and hardware within the City's boundaries. It employs two City of Joondalup residents.	70.3%	\$5,028,576	1

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Access Without Barriers Pty Ltd (AWB Co.) All requirements have been met.	Compliant	The company was launched in 2013 and employs 47 full-time employees. Registrations and licences were sighted for key personnel. Its organisational chart depicted divisions for the maintenance and minor works departments headed by two managers. A summary of relevant experience and qualifications gained which were appropriate for the City's requirements was noted for twenty-three key personnel with time allocated to the project difficult to interpret. The company has nominated 12 sub-contractors covering cabinetry, asbestos removal, painting, brickwork, tiling, earthworks and flooring and included a summary of their services. It has service and tradespeople rostered 24/7 however, administrative staff are the first point of contact for emergencies. A list of plant and equipment, including quantities, description and purpose was submitted.	The company demonstrated substantial experience in completing similar projects. It conducts reactive and renewal maintenance, minor works and cyclical routine maintenance for the City of Stirling (\$600k p.a.) across 174 buildings, and general building maintenance and roof repairs for the Town of Victoria Park, 2019-2022, performing office modifications, ceiling repairs, paving and brickwork, and handyman services. Similarities and outcomes to the City's scope of works were submitted encompassing emergency callouts, complex working environments, and key performance measurements. It has also been performing general building maintenance for Programmed Facility Management, 2017-2022 (\$12m p.a.), specialising in works for the Department of Education, and has been delivering 2,000 minor works requests for up to \$250,000 for the Department of Training and Workforce Development. Project reference sheets were noted.	The company demonstrated a good understanding of the required tasks. The company operates a job management system via SimPro to ensure it can easily track and record individual jobs. Information relating to how each job will be scheduled and how it is logged and tracked was provided including screenshots from SimPro for the relevant stages of the process. A clear explanation for how work orders are raised and actioned was sighted with quotes broken down into labour, materials and warranties. Its proposed onboarding timeline outlined the requirements for data collection and initial system set up, to fine tuning maintenance schedules for critical items / assets. Its methodology for transition highlighted the responsibilities of the parties and how the tasks will be assigned. Key risks were identified during the transition period with mitigation strategies provided. Attendance on site after hours did not correspond with the City's expected timeframes.	The company is located in Burswood and has eight employees residing in various suburbs within the City of Joondalup. Two of its nominated sub-contractors are located in Hillarys and Ocean Reef.	62.9%	\$5,922,958	2

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>Hoskins Investments Pty Ltd as trustee for M R Hoskins Family Trust (AE Hoskins Building Services)</p> <p>All requirements have not been met.</p>	Partially Compliant	<p>The company was established in 1911. It employs 104 staff, 90 full-time and 60 tradespeople. In addition to its internal capabilities, the company has access to a large pool of pre-qualified sub-contractors. It submitted an organisation chart depicting carpenters, painters, cabinetmakers, and has nominated a sub-contractor for bricklaying. Its proposed personnel comprises a contract manager and supervisors for each discipline with appropriate qualifications and experience noted to perform the services. Whilst it did not provide specific details for its asbestos licence, it was noted that one of its technical resources has this certification. No information was provided to demonstrate skills of tradespersons. It operates a maintenance phone line however did not include a contact for emergencies. Its plant and equipment did not reference quantities.</p>	<p>The company demonstrated substantial experience in completing similar projects and cited three current contracts it has with local governments City of Stirling from 2016 (\$2.08m p.a.) panel member for general building services across 235 buildings and 222 minor asset structures including reactive, preventative and minor works; City of Subiaco from 2018 (\$150k p.a.) sole supplier of facility maintenance across 40 buildings; and City of Perth from 2018 (\$400k p.a.) panel member for the provision of general maintenance across 90 buildings Three examples of completed minor works projects including their project descriptions, photos, similarities and challenges were submitted for Town of Cambridge in 2019 (\$172k) additions and renovations, and for City of Stirling in 2019 (\$216k) and 2018 (\$185k) building upgrades. A list of 49 completed project works up to \$250k was sighted.</p>	<p>The company demonstrated a good understanding of the required tasks. It confirmed the ability to meet the defined response timeframes and its approach for raising reactive maintenance work orders through to invoicing for the jobs once completed. It clearly defined the methodology it will use to assess larger non-reactive works from preparing quotations and charging for the works once finished including a breakdown of labour and materials, description and location of the works, and warranty data. Details for how it will track time and attendance of tradespersons on site, sign-in to site registers and conduct risk assessments prior to progressing with any works was noted. It has an electronic system, SimPro, in place to manage all job requests. A daily report on works due for completion is produced to ensure all works meet their deadline.</p>	<p>The company operates from Balcatta. The company will engage material and service suppliers within the City of Joondalup including Wattyl Paint Centre and Bunnings Warehouse. It employs 26 people who reside within the City's boundaries.</p>	62.1%	\$5,926,884	3

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Orixon Pty Ltd	Compliant	<p>The company was established in 2007 and has 20 personnel. Its organisation structure was submitted accompanied by resumes for six key managers with appropriate qualifications, trade certificates and relevant industry experience. It has nominated eight sub-contractors to provide elements such as bricklaying, painting, cabinetry, and asbestos removal with supporting registration documents sighted. Experience of these trades was lacking. An extensive list of plant and equipment was noted. It will hire additional equipment if needed. It is able to scale up its resources where additional personnel are required but did not specifically state how this will be achieved. Whilst it stated that it will service the scope of works out of hours by having local team members added to a structured roster system, emergency contact information was not sighted.</p>	<p>The company demonstrated good experience in completing similar projects. It cited three contracts it has performed for the Department of Building Management and Works 2014-2024, for minor construction and maintenance repair projects, and registered builder panel construction projects (\$1.6m p.a. and \$1.4m p.a. respectively), Programmed Facility Management 2017-2021 for a panel of builders to undertake approximately 140 projects per annum (\$2.56m p.a.) and Western Power 2012-2020 for reactive and planned maintenance works (\$300k p.a.). Contract descriptions, successes and lessons learnt, sub-contractors used and scheduled versus actual completion dates were included. It submitted details for a further 15 refurbishment and remedial works projects it had completed and the assigned project manager however dates, contract values and length of contract were omitted for these projects.</p>	<p>The company demonstrated a sound understanding of the required tasks. It provided details for its contract management team and responsibilities. Its maintenance methodology comprised how it will process work orders, enter relevant data into its online job management system, generate contract specific checklists for the team and auditors, perform risk assessments, communicate with the City, check for asbestos, perform condition audits, order materials, store plant and equipment, perform quality control, generate reports, remove rubbish, and invoice. A similar in depth methodology was noted for the management of minor works projects with the addition of traffic management arrangements and scheduling using Gantt charts to depict critical paths. It will attend emergency calls outs after business hours with a dedicated contact number to be provided for this purpose.</p>	<p>The company operates from Osborne Park, currently employs City of Joondalup residents, and will engage tradespersons residing within the City's boundaries.</p>	60.1%	\$6,546,603	4
All requirements have been met.								

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>Devco Holdings Pty Ltd as trustee for the Devereux Family Trust (Devco Builders)</p> <p>All requirements have not been met.</p>	Partially Compliant	<p>The company began in 1986 and employs 20 full time and seven casual staff. An organisation structure was submitted accompanied by summaries of key personnel, including carpenters and bricklayers, highlighting appropriate industry experience and qualifications. The nominated sub-contractors have relevant painting licences and appropriate previous experience. Copies of the company's restricted asbestos licence and registered building certificate were sighted. Its submitted list of plant and equipment, which included photos and quantities, was sufficient to undertake the works. It has an after-hours tradesperson and manager on call 24 hours a day, 7 days a week and provided mobile contact information for the nominated site supervisor and General Manager. It will hire in additional equipment using its existing relationships with rental companies and has a pool of existing sub-contractors.</p>	<p>The company demonstrated very good experience in completing similar projects with four contracts noted for the Cities of Joondalup from 2010-2018, Vincent from 2011-2021, Swan from 2014-2022 and Development WA from 2015-2022. Elements of each contract were noted as being similar to the City's requirements, including delivering preventative and reactive maintenance services, minor project works and new installations to numerous buildings and infrastructure assets. Outcomes of each contract were provided. A list of current contracts was not sighted with the Evaluation Panel unable to ascertain how many contracts the company is currently servicing.</p>	<p>The company did not provide any explanation for how it will approach the works or submit its proposed methodology including timeframes.</p>	<p>The company operates from its main office in Wangara. It has other facilities in Bellevue and Dunsborough. It proposes to use local suppliers in Winton Road for the provision of plumbing products, doors, tools, equipment hire, gyprock and general hardware. It employs City of Joondalup residents.</p>	52.6%	\$5,012,592	5

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
JDS Building & Maintenance Services Pty Ltd All requirements have not been met.	Partially Compliant	The company is run by the director who has 30 years' experience in the building industry. It employs 28 people. It submitted its organisation structure depicting carpenters, painter and bricklayer and a breakdown of personnel who will be assigned to the scope of works which contradicts information provided elsewhere in the submission. It was therefore unclear how many positions will be appointed to each these disciplines. Conversely, the majority of personnel will not be required as the City has appointed its own contractors for plumbing and electrical services. A brief summary of staff qualifications and years' experience was provided with minimal information included to demonstrate industry experience. The list of plant and equipment was limited with crucial items to be used for the scope of works omitted. Out of hours calls are redirected to a nominated standby contractor.	The company demonstrated good experience in completing similar projects and cited five contracts it has held with Health Services Network for ongoing maintenance from 2018 (\$1.1m), Child and Adolescent Health Service for refurbishment works in 2020 (\$60k), City of Armadale construction and fit out of new toilets in 2020 (\$58k), Department of Health from 2020-2021 for washroom upgrades (\$158k), and Programmed Property Services for roof replacement in 2019 (\$250k). Project overviews comprising trades used, time to complete, deliverables and achieved results were noted and photos were sighted of works completed.	The company demonstrated a basic understanding of the required tasks. The company has an online form which is used to capture all maintenance requests regardless of whether it is notified by phone or SMS. It provided details for its order management system which tracks personnel via location and is used to update clients as to progress with works being conducted. The system also has ability to log materials on a job by job basis and can assign asset IDs allowing for a customised maintenance plan to be generated for performing routine maintenance which is outside of the scope of works. Screenshots were submitted showing job requests, their progress and priority assigned. The methodology for how it will physically conduct the works was not specified.	The company is registered in Butler and is operated from Bayswater and a workshop in Wangara. It did not meet any criteria under this qualitative category.	46.8%	\$5,661,566	6

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>Protek Carpentry & Fencing Services Pty Ltd (Protek 24/7)</p> <p>All requirements have not been met.</p>	Partially Compliant	<p>The company was founded in 1998. Its workforce fluctuates between 35-50 full time employees. An organisation chart was noted accompanied by staff profiles for six key managerial and safety staff highlighting previous roles, industry experience, relevant qualifications, building registration, restricted asbestos licence and police clearance certifications. Whilst it provided names of its sub-contractors for painting and bricklaying, supported by a registered painting licence, it was not clear who would be performing the role of carpenter, as resumes for tradespersons were omitted from the submission. The organisation operates 24/7 with an afterhours line monitored by both on-call technical trade staff and administrative staff. The ability to provide additional personnel and resources was not specifically addressed and the list of plant and equipment to be used for the scope of works was minimal.</p>	<p>The company demonstrated some experience in completing similar projects. It submitted details for three minor works projects it had completed for Programmed Facility Management for construction of ablution blocks (\$384k), PathWest for creation of a new collection centre (\$114k) and East Metropolitan Health Services (\$119k) for a new office area. Examples to demonstrate ability to perform ongoing maintenance service contracts were not evidenced.</p>	<p>The company did not demonstrate sufficient understanding of the required tasks. It submitted its critical assumptions which stated that no allowances had been made for works outside of 7.00am to 4.00 pm Monday to Friday which is contrary to statements made elsewhere in the submission. It stated that it will be on a panel contract which is not the intent of the tender. It provided some information regarding how it will use a construction project cost control system to monitor costs incurred and actual costs of materials, labour, plant and equipment. Most of the methodology was for undertaking construction type activities with little information provided for its approach to conducting works outside of business hours and ongoing maintenance services.</p>	The company operates from three locations in WA, Perth, Kelmscott and Burswood. It did not meet any criteria in this qualitative category.	34.2%	\$6,012,683	7

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Marawar Pty Ltd All requirements have been met	Partially Compliant	The company began business operations in 2019 and employs 31 staff. Its organisation structure was submitted headed by a construction manager with support from a project team and departments for carpentry, painting and plumbing. Whilst it included resumes for its key supervisory and managerial staff to demonstrate appropriate industry experience and qualifications, it did not provide any details for its tradespersons. It is also uncertain who will be performing bricklaying services as no sub-contractors have been nominated for this discipline. Building registration certification, restricted asbestos licence and painting registration were sighted. It did not provide a list of its proposed plant and equipment and did not provide details of an emergency contact person as it has a dedicated after hours service which is outsourced to a service call centre.	The company provided insufficient detail to demonstrate its experience in completing similar projects. It included high level information for three contracts it has with Programmed Facility Management from 2019-2022 (\$300k p.a.), Town of Cambridge (\$1m p.a.) and Public Transport Authority from 2021-2024. Aspects such as carrying out repairs and maintenance across various trades including carpentry, painting and tiling and achieving key performance indicators were noted however the scale of each contract, the specific scope of works, and outcomes were omitted.	The company demonstrated a limited understanding of the required tasks. It provided a high level overview for how it will action work requests during normal business hours with its dedicated administration staff monitoring phones and email correspondence from serviced clients. After hours calls and emergencies will be redirected to a service call centre which conveys the relevant information to the first rostered team member for action. It did not have a defined methodology for how the company will conduct any of the works whilst on site, particularly minor works, prepare quotations, or maintain warranty data.	The company operates from West Leederville. It employs City of Joondalup residents.	33.3%	\$5,457,007	8

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
M Construction (WA) Pty Ltd All requirements have not been met.	Partially Compliant	The company has 11 years' experience and employs 22 staff. An organisation structure showed the proposed team comprising the operations manager supported by a safety officer and project team of eight employees, two being carpenters. Resumes were sighted for the director and key managerial staff with no details provided for the site supervisor or trades personnel to ascertain relevant experience and qualifications required to perform the scope of works. Painting and bricklaying services will be sub-contracted. The company's building registration and restricted asbestos licence were both sighted. The company provided an afterhours contact number but did not include details for an emergency contact or address how it will provide additional personnel and resources other than it will conduct regular capacity testing. Details for specialised equipment were omitted.	The company did not demonstrate adequate experience in completing similar projects. Whilst it cited three maintenance contracts it has with Programmed Facility Management, Department of Finance and City of Stirling, there was very little detail provided for each contract to ascertain what the maintenance services entailed, such as the length of the contract, value, scale, scope of works, similarities and outcomes.	The company demonstrated a very basic understanding of the required tasks with a generic methodology provided which was not tailored to the City's requirements. Aspects such as the process for managing emergency call outs, complying with the City's expected turnaround times, how it will quote and invoice, provide warranty information and conduct works on site were lacking. Some references appear to not be related to the City's scope of works.	The company operates from West Leederville and employs City of Joondalup residents.	22.9%	\$5,523,185	9

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
<p>Programmed Facility Management Pty Ltd (Programmed Building Projects)</p> <p>All requirements have not been met</p>	Partially Compliant	<p>The company commenced in 1951 and employs 20,000 nationally and within New Zealand. It is uncertain how many employees are located in WA. Two organisation structures were submitted for the national operations team and for the WA team showing the state manager, project manager and site supervisor accompanied by detailed resumes for the two managers only to illustrate key project experience and qualifications relevant to the scope of works. It was unclear who will undertake trades positions such as carpentry, painting and brickwork as resumes were not included. It will sub-contract any works involving asbestos. A copy of the building licence was sighted. It did not submit a list of its proposed plant and equipment, did not acknowledge how it will source additional personnel / equipment, and did not address who will be the emergency contact for out of hours within its Submission.</p>	<p>The company provided an extensive list of contracts that was difficult to read highlighting projects either completed or underway, a brief description, value, expected closure date and client. Two projects were noted for the City of Canning. Examples of similar contracts, outcomes and ability to undertake the scope of works to the City's specifications were not evidenced.</p>	<p>The company did not address this criterion.</p>	<p>The company has offices in Burswood, Belmont and Rottnest Island. It did not meet any criteria under this qualitative category.</p>	17.2%	\$6,494,290	10

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Trayd Australia Pty Ltd All requirements have not been met	Partially Compliant	<p>The company employs 30 qualified staff including three apprentices. The two key personnel assigned to the scope of works, being an electrical contractor and a plumbing contractor, are trades not required under the City's specifications. Very brief details were provided for additional persons (estimator / carpenter, register builder and director) showing years of experience and qualifications obtained. Whilst the company submitted its certificate of registration for painting, it is unclear who will be providing painting services. It has nominated a sub-contractor to undertake asbestos related activities. An email address and phone numbers were provided for dedicated after hours contact(s). Details for specialised equipment that will be used on the City's scope of works were not sighted. The ability to provide additional resources was not addressed.</p>	<p>The company did not demonstrate sufficient experience in completing similar projects. It provided examples of contracts it has undertaken which were predominantly small minor works projects for the City of Canning (\$64k, \$87k and \$69k) involving the replacement of existing assets and performing internal renovations. One larger project was noted for Spotless at Westminster Primary School (\$300k) for the demolition of redundant electrical and plumbing systems and installation of new electrical systems, plumbing and air conditioning. Some elements of each contract were noted as being comparable to the City's requirements. Evidence to support experience in managing ongoing maintenance contracts including responding to emergencies outside of business hours was not sighted.</p>	<p>Its priority levels do not accord with the City's requirements for emergency response. Methodology and approach to the works were not specifically addressed.</p>	<p>It operates from Malaga. It stated that 50% of its staff are residents within the City of Joondalup.</p>	14.3%	\$6,257,509	11

Tenderer & Description of Response	Is it Compliant? Yes or No	Comment Against Criteria				Evaluation Score	Estimated Total Comparative Price	Rank
		Capacity	Demonstrated Experience in Completing Similar Projects	Demonstrated Understanding of the Required Tasks	Social and economic effects on the local community			
Tardan Pty Ltd (Western Projects) All requirements were not met	No	The Submission from Western Projects did not indicate any compliance with the conditions of tendering and contract, or compliance with the specification. It has currently insufficient insurance coverage for loss of keys, provided no quality assurance or quality management process documentation, and no details of asbestos licence and police clearances. Whilst it stated that it has not nominated sub-contractors, there are trades required for the scope of works which have not been included.					\$5,795,753	N/A
Vidal Consultants Pty Ltd (Vidal Construction) All requirements were not met	No	The Submission currently has insufficient insurance cover for Public Liability, has provided no quality assurance or quality management process documentation and no details for its asbestos licence or police clearances. Sub-contractors nominated do not include asbestos removal and limited information was provided for employees to ascertain what licence and qualifications are held in-house.					\$8,770,399	N/A